

An Evaluation of Cambodian English Language Pre-Service Teacher Training Program at National Institute of Education in Cambodia

- Khleang Sovann
- Montien Chomdokmai

Abstract. This study aimed to; (1) evaluate the effectiveness of the Cambodian English Language Pre-service Teacher Training Program (CEL-PTTP) at the National Institute of Education (NIE), and (2) propose appropriate guidelines to improve the CEL-PTTP. The study was based on Kirkpatrick and Kirkpatrick's (2006) four-level model of training evaluation. The quantitative data were collected from 89 teacher trainees using an English standardized test, a Teaching Knowledge Test (TKT), and a self-administered questionnaire, and were analyzed by descriptive statistics, while the qualitative data were collected from 5 teacher trainers, and 2 administrators through a semi-structured interview, and were analyzed by qualitative content analysis. The findings revealed that the CEL-PTTP was effective to some extent; that is, the trainees' reaction toward the CEL-PTTP was at "Neutral" level. The trainees' knowledge and skill were at "Average" level, while their attitude was changed positively. This meant that trainees' learning level was slightly improved and their behavior was positively changed to some extent. The Cambodian upper secondary schools gained some benefits from the CEL-PTTP. Another finding suggested four dimensions as the proposed guidelines for the NIE's management team to consider when planning and conducting the CEL-PTTP in the following years. The four dimensions are: (1) Improving Learning Environment, (2) Upgrading Training Resources, (3) Improving Training Curriculum, and (4) Enhancing Program Management.

Keywords: Program Evaluation, EFL Pre-Service Teacher Training, Teacher Education, National Institute of Education, Cambodia.

Introduction

The political, social, economic, cultural, and educational realities have forced Cambodia to reflect on the mission and organization of the education sector in order to strengthen and broaden the quality of teaching and learning to compete with regional and global challenges. In this regard, the ability to teach English as a foreign language to Cambodian students in Upper Secondary Schools (USSs) will continue to be the main component of the teacher training program in the area of lifelong education. Additionally, UNESCO Phnom Penh (2010) stated that English is popular as a second language among the Cambodian young people. Furthermore, either English or French are the compulsory subjects in secondary schools. Officially, Cambodian children start learning English as a foreign language subject at the age of 12 or 13. However, many may start learning a foreign language earlier by attending private classes. Presently, more and more higher education institutions use English as a medium of instruction.

The Cambodian English Language Pre-service Teacher Training Program (CEL-PTTP) is a one-year training program which prepares English major graduates to become teachers of English in upper secondary schools throughout the country. The CEL-PTTP is conducted at the National Institute of Education (NIE) and since its introduction in 1996, no formal evaluation has been conducted to find its effectiveness to meet the needs of the current challenging education context. Consequently, there are concerns that if the training program is not effective, it may affect the quality of teaching of the

trainees in the upper secondary schools. To achieve the quality of teaching and learning required, then the quality of teachers must also be improved.

The effectiveness of the CEL-PTTP is in need of evaluation in order to help improve the program in the following academic years, as well as to contribute to EFL teacher development in Cambodia. As stated by a former trainee of the CEL-PTTP, "...my English proficiency was not improved, program management was ineffective, and some trainers were not qualified enough..." (personal communication, February 11, 2011). Moreover, an administrator of NIE asserted, "...we need more researchers to evaluate so as to help us in finding out weaknesses, challenges, and strengths so that we can walk in the right way to meet our goals..." (personal communication, September 15, 2010).

For this reason, the present researcher attempted to evaluate the effectiveness of the CEL-PTTP at the NIE and to propose appropriate guidelines for improving the training program. To respond to the purposes of the study, two research questions were addressed:

1. To what extent is the Cambodian English Language Pre-service Teacher Training Program effective?

2. What are appropriate guidelines to use for improving the Cambodian English Language Pre-service Teacher Training program?

The findings are expected to be useful and reliable in providing evidence about the worthiness of the CEL-PTTP. The findings directly provide the trainers with comprehensive information that they can use to improve their teaching, as they are also the important stakeholders in making the program effective or ineffective. More importantly, the findings are especially beneficial to administrators (director board) of the NIE, and offer guidelines to improve the whole program in the following academic years. The administrators can use these findings as guidelines to write proposals to any development partner and to the Ministry of Education, Youth, and Sport for the purpose of requesting additional budget or resources to support the program. Furthermore, the findings may alert and attract development partners to consider providing both financial and technical assistance to improve the CEL-PTTP.

Literature Review

For over fifty years, starting with the first edition in 1959 until the most recent in 2006, business people and academics alike have turned to Kirkpatrick's four-level training evaluation model (Kirkpatrick & Kirkpatrick, 2006). According to this model, evaluation should begin with the first level and move sequentially through levels two, three, and four. The four levels in order from first to last are reaction, learning, behavior, and results. The first level is *reaction*; it evaluates how those who participate in the training react to it. Kirkpatrick and Kirkpatrick (2006) called this a measure of customer satisfaction. The second level is *learning*. Learning is defined as "the extent to which participants change attitudes, increase knowledge, and/or increase skill as a result of attending the training program" (Kirkpatrick & Kirkpatrick, 2006, p. 22). The model argues that learning has taken place if one or more of the following have occurred: 1) attitudes have changed; 2) knowledge is increased; and/or 3) skills have improved. The third level is *behavior*. Kirkpatrick and Kirkpatrick (2006) explain that the third level evaluates "the extent to which change in behavior occurred" (p. 22). The fourth level is *results*. Kirkpatrick and Kirkpatrick (2006) define *results* as the final results that occurred because of the training (e.g., increased production, improved quality, reduced turnover, and higher profits).

The abovementioned four levels defined the effectiveness of the Cambodian English Language Pre-service Teacher Training Program. Firstly, reaction to the training program is measured on the trainee's satisfaction towards the courses, trainers, and learning environment after the training program. Secondly, the trainees' degree of learning has improved. Their knowledge and skills have improved and their attitudes toward the course have changed positively after receiving the CEL-PTTP. Thirdly, the behavior is changed positively. Finally, the organization (i.e., upper secondary schools) gains the benefit from the CEL-PTTP.

Many evaluation studies using the Kirkpatrick model have been carried out. For instance, Tunç (2010) conducted a study entitled "Evaluation of an English language teaching program at a public



university using CIPP model”. The study aimed to evaluate the effectiveness of the Ankara University Preparatory School program through the perspectives of instructors and students. The results revealed that some improvements in the physical conditions, content, materials and assessment dimensions of the program were required to make the program more effective. Previously, Bhasuk (1990) conducted a study to evaluate the context and input of the English Language Teaching-Methodology and Practice (ELT-MAP) Program II organized by the Department of Vocational Education of Ministry of Education in Thailand. The findings indicated that the trainees had problems in teaching concerning methodology, language competence, students, and testing and teaching evaluation. Furthermore, the trainees and trainers suggested that the duration of the training program should be reduced and the trainers should have more time to prepare themselves. Moreover, a study entitled “Teacher training follow-up: A study report” conducted by the National Center for Educational Development of Nepal (2000) revealed that the trained teachers were found to be not quite competent in classroom management. Their performance was low in construction and display of basic and creative educational materials in the classroom. In addition, the trained teachers were able to use different teaching methods, but they were not competent enough to use student-centered methods appropriately. On the other hand, Chheang (2008)’s research entitled “Effectiveness of training information and communication technology by Khmer language software: A case study of the National Institute of Education, Cambodia” showed that most of the trainees were satisfied with the training program. Their knowledge, skill and attitude towards Khmer language software training program were improved significantly, which indicated that the training program was partly effective. However, after receiving the training program, the trainees’ behavior was inefficient because only the IT staff members were able to fully apply their learning to their jobs. The results of the training program were highly beneficial in terms of providing training, particularly to IT staff. Similarly, Bray and Howard (1990) studied the “Methodological considerations in the evaluation of a teacher training program”. The study found that the training produced significant changes in the teaching behavior, self-ratings of teaching ability, and student ratings of instruction of graduate teaching assistants.

Research Design

Population and Sample

In this study, there was a total of 89 trainees, 17 trainers, 4 deputy directors, and a director of the CEL-PTTP in the 16th batch of academic year 2010 – 2011 at the NIE.

For quantitative data: Among all 89 trainees, 10 trainees were randomly selected to complete the questionnaires for the pilot study, while the remaining 79 trainees were asked to fill in the real questionnaires. Moreover, all 89 trainees were asked to take the two standardized tests.

For qualitative data: 5 trainers out of 17 were non-randomly invited for a semi-structured interview through snowball sampling. In this sampling method, the researcher asked for assistance from the deputy head of the Education Department of the NIE to recommend 5 trainers who taught in the CEL-PTTP. In addition, a deputy director and a director of NIE were invited for an interview to measure the trainees’ changes in behavior (behavior) and the benefits that the organizations received (organizational results).

Research Instruments Development

A. Quantitative research instruments

Both a questionnaire and the two standardized tests were used to measure and explore the trainees’ reaction and learning (i.e., knowledge, skills and attitude). The questionnaire and the standardized tests were used separately.

The questionnaire consisted of four parts. *Part 1* described the trainee’s demographic data, including age, gender, education level, and teaching experience. *Part 2* was the rating of the trainee’s reaction or satisfaction towards training resources, subjects, trainers, learning environment, and other contributed factors after attending the training program. It consisted of thirty-eight items. Each item of the questionnaire was rated using a 5-point Likert rating scale, ranging from very satisfied (5) to very

dissatisfied (1). *Part 3* was the rating of the trainee's attitude toward the CEL-PTTP, consisting of 10 items. Each item was rated by the trainees on a 5-point Likert scale, ranging from strongly agree (5) to strongly disagree (1). *Part 4* was an open-ended question section which consisted of five critical questions.

There were two different types of standardized tests applied in this research study. The English standardized test was employed to measure the trainee's knowledge (English proficiency knowledge), whereas Teaching Knowledge Test (TKT) was used to rate each trainee's skills (teaching ability). The maximum score of the English standardized test was 35 and the time provided was 50 minutes. And the maximum score of the TKT was 80 and the time provided was 90 minutes. The two tests were used to measure knowledge and skills of the learning level.

B. Qualitative research instrument

A semi-structured interview was used to measure each trainee's behavior and organizational results after the CEL-PTTP. The researcher, by non-random selection, conducted the semi-structured interview with 5 trainers, and a deputy director and a director of the NIE who were knowledgeable about trainees' behavior and the results, which the Cambodian upper secondary schools would gain from the CEL-PTTP.

Validity and Reliability of Research Instruments

For the validity, at first, the questionnaire and interview guideline were checked by three experts in the field of EFL teacher training/education. Then, the two instruments were finalized after receiving feedback and recommendations from the advisory committee. Finally, the Item-Objective Congruence (IOC) was used to evaluate the items of the questionnaire based on the score which ranged from -1 to 1 (Congruent = +1, Questionable = 0, Incongruent = -1). The results from the IOC showed that all items of the instruments were congruent, which means that the instruments (questionnaire and interview guidelines) were definitely valid and applicable.

The reliability of the questionnaire was determined to ensure that the responses collected were reliable and consistent. The questionnaire was piloted with 10 trainees who were not in the sample group. The reliability value was calculated by using Cronbach's alpha (α) in order to ensure whether there is internal consistency within the items. The reliability of the questionnaire must be at least 0.70 to be considered 'acceptable'.

The result of Cronbach's alpha coefficient of questionnaire from the pilot study was 0.948, which was highly reliable and consistent.

Table 1. The value of Cronbach's alpha from pilot study

Item's Theme	Cronbach's Alpha	Number of Items
Reaction and Attitude	0.948	48

Data Collection and Analysis

Quantitative Data Analysis

The researcher attempted to distribute the 48-item self-administered questionnaire to 79 trainees (excluding 10 trainees for the pilot study), but in reality the researcher was able to meet and administer questionnaire to only 64 trainees, and 57 trainees returned their completed questionnaires, which is equal to 89 percent. It took about 60 minutes for the questionnaire to be filled in.

The researcher attempted to use two standardized post-tests to collect quantitative data from 89 trainees of the program. However, he was able to meet and administer the English standardized tests to only 42 trainees and 100 percent of them returned them completed, while the TKT was disseminated to 53 trainees and 100 percent of them returned alike. These numbers did not meet the projected number of participants due to their unpredictable absence after the second semester examination during the period of data collection from July until August 2011. The participants were



given 50 minutes for taking the 35-item-English standardized test, and 90 minutes was allocated to them to do the 80-item-TKT.

The descriptive statistics, frequency, minimum, maximum, percentage, mean, and standard deviation (SD), were applied to analyze the quantitative data. The data were processed and analyzed electronically using computer application software.

Qualitative Data Collection and Analysis

The researcher collected qualitative data through a face-to-face semi-structured interview with 5 trainers and 2 administrators of the NIE by himself. To ensure a large amount of comprehensive data, each participant was asked to record his/her voice. Moreover, 50-60 minutes was allocated for each interview. During the process of interviewing, the researcher also took some time to take notes.

The qualitative content analysis method, including transcribing, coding and interpretation, was applied to analyze the qualitative data. The qualitative data were analyzed to interpret each trainee’s behavior and organization results.

Results and Discussion

In response to the first question *“To what extent is the Cambodian English Language Pre-service Teacher Training Program effective?”*

Level 1: Reaction to the CEL-PTTP

Table 2. Average value of trainee’s reaction and attitude (N = 57)

Descriptive Statistics	\bar{X}	SD	Level
Reaction			
Training Resources	3.54	0.66	Satisfied
Training Subjects	3.42	0.65	Satisfied
Trainers	3.35	0.60	Neutral
Learning Environment	3.16	0.61	Neutral
Other factors	3.47	0.75	Satisfied
Total Average Value	3.39	0.65	Neutral

Table 2 demonstrated that the total average value of the trainees’ reaction towards the Cambodian English Language Pre-service Teacher Training Program (CEL-PTTP) was rated at the “Neutral” level (neither satisfied nor dissatisfied) ($\bar{X} = 3.39$; $SD = 0.65$). Among the several factors of the reaction, training resources ($\bar{X} = 3.54$; $SD = 0.66$), training subjects ($\bar{X} = 3.42$; $SD = 0.65$), and other factors ($\bar{X} = 3.47$; $SD = 0.75$) of the CEL-PTTP were considered to be satisfactory, as rated by the trainees.

However, the trainers ($\bar{X} = 3.35$; $SD = 0.60$) and learning environment ($\bar{X} = 3.16$; $SD = 0.61$) of the CEL-PTTP were rated at the “Neutral” level.

There were several possible reasons for the trainer and learning environment factors to be rated as “Neutral”. First, while trainees demanded more supportive handouts, trainers failed to provide sufficient. Second, trainers were not highly responsive to the trainees’ needs. Third, trainers’ presentation (teaching) styles needed to be more effective. Fourth, trainees demanded trainers to be more prepared before class; fifth, trainees wished to have chance to evaluate the trainers; sixth, trainees wished to have friendly and responsible NIE office staff; and seventh, the campus did not really support the trainees’ learning. On the other hand, though the trainees rated as “Satisfied” on the training resources, training subjects, and other factors sections, both trainees and trainers still recommended some points to improve the CEL-PTTP in the open-ended questions section of the questionnaire and interview. For example, textbooks and other teaching and learning materials should be up-to-date, sufficiently supplied, and effectively used (as revealed in the open-ended question, the questionnaire items and the interviews with trainers). Bhasuk (1990) found a similar result, that the

majority of the trainees wanted to drop some subjects which were not relevant to their work, and the training duration could not cover all the subjects of the training program. This was in the line with the current result that the trainees wanted the NIE to drop some irrelevant subjects in order to concentrate more on the most useful subjects and extend teaching hours (showed in the open-ended questions and the questionnaire items).

In addition, in his study, Tunç (2010) found that an improvement in the physical conditions of the training program was required to make the program more effective. This confirmed the finding of the learning environment of the current study which the trainees rated at the “Neutral” level. That is, the trainees requested an improvement of the learning environment. In addition, recommendations for improving the training program from Tunç’s study indicated that the trainers should spend more time in preparation for the training courses they teach. This finding is consistent with the current finding, which suggests an improvement for training subjects and trainers themselves.

In summary, because the two factors, namely trainers and learning environment were statistically rated at “Neutral” level, it was suggested that further improvement is needed for these factors to make the whole CEL-PTTP more effective.

Level 2: Learning from the CEL-PTTP

1. Trainees’ knowledge

Table 3. English standardized test score of the trainees

Descriptive Statistics	N	Minimum	Maximum	Mean	SD	Level
English test Score/35	42	15.00	32.00	22.93	4.24	Average
Valid N (listwise)						

As seen in Table 3, the trainees’ knowledge after completing the CEL-PTTP, measured by the English standardized test score, was rated as being at the “Average” level with the mean score level of 22.93 ($SD = 4.24$).

2. Trainees’ skills

Table 4. TKT’s test score of the trainees

Descriptive Statistics	N	Minimum	Maximum	Mean	SD	Level
TKT’s Test Score/80	53	16.00	74.00	43.39	11.45	Average
Valid N (listwise)						

As seen in Table 4, the trainees’ skills after completing the CEL-PTTP measured by the TKT score was rated as being at the “Average” level, with the mean score level of 43.39 ($SD = 11.45$).

3. Trainees’ attitudes

Table 5. Average value of trainees’ attitude

Descriptive Statistics	Mean	SD	Opinion
Attitude			
Total Average Value	3.68	.61	Agree

In Table 5, the total average value of the trainees’ attitude towards the CEL-PTTP was rated as being at the “Agree” level, with the mean level of 3.68 ($SD = 0.61$).

The findings confirmed that the trainees’ knowledge and skills were at the “Average” level, while



the trainees' attitudes toward the CEL-PTTP were rated as being at the "Agree" level. Even though the trainees demonstrated good feelings (attitude) towards the CEL-PTTP, their knowledge (English language competence), and skills (teaching ability) were not at a good level. For these reasons, it could be interpreted, based on the findings, that the learning level of the trainees on the CEL-PTTP was slightly improved. In this sense, there needs to be further action from the NIE to make the trainees' learning more positive.

The reason why knowledge and skills of the trainees were not at a "Good" level was probably because of the trainees' ability. That is, most trainees were not seen by their trainers to be very competent in terms of their knowledge and skill from the beginning of the training program. For example, during the semi-structured interviews with the trainers and administrators (deputy director and director of the NIE), one participant said, "*My difficulty in teaching is regarding trainee's ability. That is, some years, we could recruit many outstanding candidates, but some year the majority of candidates had mixed ability*". Also, as seen in the one item of questionnaire on attitude, trainees rated the lowest on "*The screening process of this training program was reliable and selective*". It should be noted that the CEL-PTTP was conducted in only eight months (excluding vacations). Particularly, the CEL-PTTP was mainly focused on theories rather than practices of teaching, because the duration of teaching practicum which is the most practical assignment for the trainees was just one month. Therefore, it was a short time for trainees to increase their knowledge and improve skills if they were not competent enough at the beginning of the program.

The rating of the trainees' knowledge and skills was found to be at an average rate. This is consistent with the finding of the National Center for Educational Development of Nepal (2000) in that the trained teachers were found to be not quite competent in classroom management and with Bhasuk (1990) in that the trainees were not good at teaching concerning methodology and language competence. Basically, their performance was low in construction and display of basic and creative educational materials in the classroom.

In this study, the trainees, on the other hand, demonstrated a positive attitude towards the CEL-PTTP. This is consistent with the study of Kanchanarak (2002), which revealed that most of the officers had a positive attitude toward the training on desirable competency base of trainers. Furthermore, it is consistent with the finding of Chheang (2008), whose study indicated that NIE teacher trainees had positive attitudes toward Khmer language software.

In summary, among the three sub-levels of learning (knowledge, skills and attitude), only attitude was seen to be positively changed after the trainees completed the CEL-PTTP. The other two sub-levels (knowledge and skills) need to be improved, so as to make the CEL-PTTP more effective. Nevertheless, the overall learning level showed a slight improvement.

Level 3: Behavior after the CEL-PTTP

1. Extent in which trainees would apply learning

The findings from the semi-structured interviews with trainers and administrators of the NIE asserted that the trainees would generally apply their learning in their jobs (i.e., upper secondary schools) to some extent, due to some obstacles such as the shortage of teaching and learning resources, large classes, and mixed-ability classes.

For instance, during the interview T5 explained:

- *The trainees have applied what they have learnt well. However, there had not been very easy for them to teach in the context of USSs in Cambodia because of large classes, mixed ability classes, and lack of teaching and learning materials. For these reasons, I think the trainees probably could apply their learning to some extent only.*

Similarly, T2 stated:

- *It is difficult for the trainees to apply what they have learned from NIE because of two reasons. First, some teaching methodologies require rich resources/materials, whereas some upper secondary schools in Cambodia have limited resources. Thus, the learning would not be applied successfully. Finally, since a number of students in schools are relatively large, some teaching techniques will not be applicable. In this regard, to be more successful and effective in applying these methodologies, the number of students should be somewhere around 30 or less.*

However, the above finding that the “trainees would possibly apply their learning to some extent” was partially confirmed by Bray and Howard (1990)’s study, which indicated that the training has produced significant changes in the teaching behavior.

The reasons that the trainees could possibly apply their learning in their job were perhaps because they had learnt new knowledge from the CEL-PTTP, as its curriculum was designed by adding different aspects of English Language Teaching (ELT) from what the trainees had experienced in their undergraduate education (A2). In addition, the curriculum was prepared by focusing mainly on how to teach, not what to teach (T4). It was obviously shown through the teaching practicum that the trainees would apply their learning (T4 and T5).

To reach their potential in achieving better behavior to apply learning from the CEL-PTTP to their job, the abovementioned difficulties have to be resolved. In other words, teaching and learning resources should be sufficiently supplied and classes should be relatively small and the students to be of equivalent ability (i.e., not mixed ability).

2. Types of learning trainees would apply

The semi-structured interviews with trainers and administrators showed that there are several types of learning that the trainees would apply the most. First, the trainees would use integrated methodologies (T2 and T5). This is consistent with the finding of the National Center for Educational Development of Nepal (2000), in that the trained teachers were able to use different teaching methods, but they were not competent enough to use student-centered methods appropriately. Second, they would play a role as facilitators rather than teachers (T2). Third, they would personalize their language and teaching styles to suit their classes (T2). Fourth, they would utilize available resources (T2). Fifth, they would use cooperative learning (T2). Sixth, they would be flexible (T2). They would apply learner-based teaching – LBT or a learner-centered approach (T2). Seventh, they would use most of their knowledge of English competency, knowledge of lesson planning, knowledge of psychology, and applying knowledge of material design/development (T3, T4, A1, and A2).

3. Encouragements trainees gained to apply their learning

The semi-structured interviews with trainers and administrators revealed that the trainees would be encouraged in some ways to apply their learning. First, they can be recruited as part-time specialists in the ELT field for any new project in their schools or NGOs around the communities (A1 and A2). Second, they have priority to be recruited as a trainer at NIE (T2). Third, they would have chances for being promoted to a higher position (T2 and A2). Fourth, they would be selected as an ELT team leader in their own school and/or as part-time teacher of English in private schools (A1 and A2). Fifth, they were proud of becoming NIE graduates.

Level 4: Organizational results gained from the CEL-PTTP

The critical findings asserted that the organization (upper secondary schools in Cambodia) gained benefits from the trainees who completed the CEL-PTTP. It means that the upper secondary schools where the trainees are teaching received positive impacts from the CEL-PTTP, especially quality improvement in their jobs. This result is consistent with Chheang (2008), whose study indicated that the results of the training program were highly beneficial to improve the quality of the NIE –trained IT staff’s jobs.

Cambodian upper secondary schools would benefit from the CEL-PTTP in terms of the following points. First, the quality of teaching would be improved, which ultimately leads to the improvement



of ELT in the schools as a whole (T2, T4 and A2). Second, the schools have qualified EFL teaching staff (T4 and T5). Third, the schools make use of the trainees to help to take part in other relevant projects (T4 and A2). Fourth, existing EFL teaching staff members have opportunities to improve their teaching capacity (T2).

The reasons that upper secondary schools would gain advantages from the CEL-PTTP may be because, firstly, in their job teachers (trainees) are supervised by a particular team leader from the same specialization who always followed them up, as they were novices. Therefore, these novice teachers would try their best to teach well. Secondly, teachers (the former trainees) are generally considered as qualified, since they have learnt the new knowledge concerning their subject matter (i.e., English language). For this reason, the directors of the schools would make use of them as much as possible, and this new knowledge would make their teaching more interesting, practical, and effective.

In response to the second research question “What are appropriate guidelines to improve the Cambodian English Language Pre-service Teacher Training Program at the National Institute of Education in the following years?”

This section was based on the multiple data sources in which trainees, trainers, and administrators of the NIE responded during their participation in the study. Four proposed guidelines were found and are proposed:

1. Improving Learning Environment

As shown in the questionnaire items and open-ended questions, the surrounding learning environment (e.g., classrooms, library, playgrounds – bench for relax, restrooms) was requested to be more supportive, comfortable, and cleaner for trainees. Furthermore, the NIE’s office staff should be oriented or trained in terms of their responsibilities and codes of conduct, so as to improve their working performance. Additionally, the classrooms should be less crowded in terms of the number of trainees. As T2 said “...since the number of students in the class is relatively large, some teaching techniques would not be able to be applied properly and successfully...”

2. Upgrading Training Resources

The findings derived from the questionnaire items, the open-ended questions, and the interviews with trainers suggested that, first, the teaching and learning materials and facilities should be sufficiently supplied and effectively used and maintained. Second, the library and classrooms should be enlarged and enriched, and the library should provide better service (e.g., longer opening hours) for trainees. Third, the ICT class should be equipped with more computers in good condition. Finally, the textbooks and teaching and learning documents should be up to date to be suitable for the Cambodian upper secondary schools context.

3. Improving Training Curriculum

At first, based on the data from the open-ended questions, it is recommended that some irrelevant subjects in the CEL-PTTP (e.g., art studies, general English, and cultural studies) should be excluded in order to allocate more teaching hours for relevant, major subjects (e.g., core English, teaching methodology, psychology, pedagogy, teaching professionalism, teaching practicum, and ICT), as well as to allow the training program to cover all subjects within a limited time (i.e., one year). For example, T2 said “...the time allowed was not enough for his subject as there were lots of things to cover...” Moreover, the trainees showed their “Neutral” reaction toward the item that “the training time was long enough to cover all subjects”, and item “the pace of training was appropriate” in the training subject section of the questionnaire. Secondly, there is a need for the educational research subject to be taught in a more practical way, rather than theory-based teaching. Thirdly, because trainees’ knowledge and skills were at the “Average” level, more subjects that contribute to the improvement of the English competency knowledge and teaching ability, and more teaching hours should be included in the curriculum of the CEL-PTTP. Fourthly, the trainees needed an extension of the duration of the teaching practicum, for it is the most useful part that they could gain authentic

practice before they are sent to their workplaces (upper secondary schools), as they recommended in the open-ended question section. In particular, the teaching practicum process should be more effectively and strictly managed and followed up to ensure a fair condition; and it should be ensured that trainees' supervisors always participate in the teaching practicum to assist the trainees in some ways concerning their teaching practices. Fifthly, there is a need for an English curriculum development team and sufficient budget to make a major revision of the current curriculum, so that the content of the CEL-PTTP is more practical and relevant to the context of Cambodia today (T1).

4. Enhancing Training Management

Firstly, showing their "Neutral" reaction in the questionnaire, the trainees needed the trainers who could devote more time to their teaching, and who could provide more supportive hand-outs to them. Furthermore, T2 suggested a feasibility study to be conducted with trainees at the beginning of the CEL-PTTP to find out trainees' needs and their preferences as to trainers' teaching styles, and to ensure the CEL-PTTP's practical nature and effectiveness. In regard with the trainers' encouragement, a few trainees (as written in the open-ended question) believed that the trainers would put more effort in their teaching if their monthly salary is raised. Secondly, from the questionnaire responses, the trainees suggested that professional guests or experts in the field of teacher education/training should be invited to share the best practice in English Language Teaching; and a capacity building program should be provided. By doing so, both the trainers and trainees would be able to engage more in professional development. Thirdly, the trainees also requested more study tours, especially their request for a counseling service, because the trainees who came from the provinces, as most of them did not have any relative in the city, were prone to have problems concerning their living conditions. So, they needed the NIE to help or advise them (coded from the open-ended questions). Fourthly, the trainees requested an increase of their monthly allowance and the arrangement of an on-campus dormitory, since most of them had to do part-time jobs (and their jobs interfered their studies at the NIE), while some could not even find jobs and had to depend totally on their poor parents in the provinces to pay for renting rooms and their living costs (coded from the open-ended questions). Fifthly, both trainers and trainees recommended a compilation of course books for the internal use in the NIE that is suitable to apply in the context of Cambodia (coded from open-ended questions). Sixth, a lot of trainees demanded a strict and fair enforcement of the internal regulation (coded from open-ended questions). Seventh, the trainees required an effective way of communicating information within the NIE, as they sometimes missed the important information which caused them difficulties in communicating with the schools (coded from open-ended questions). Eighth, as showed their "Neutral" reaction in the questionnaire, the trainees preferred a chance to evaluate their trainers. Lastly, there is a concern with the trainees' screening process (recruitment process) as T2 elaborated "*...in some academic years we gained many outstanding trainees, but in some other years (including this year) we gained lots of mixed ability trainees...*"

Recommendations for Improving Practices

Based on the research findings from a combination of data drawn from the questionnaire items, open-ended questions, and semi-structured interviews, the CEL-PTTP at the NIE was effective to some extent. Therefore, to make the CEL-PTTP in following years more effective, recommendations were given to trainers and administrators of the NIE and the Ministry of Education, Youth, and Sport.

First of all, the NIE should improve the learning environment and other related factors that did not properly and sufficiently support trainees' learning, such as the classroom and library atmosphere and learning space in the campus. More hygienic classrooms and campus, a smaller number of trainees in a class, and library working hours extension are preferred by the trainees. Moreover, the relevant office staff members are helpers of the trainees. If they would communicate more effectively with the trainees, it would be more supportive for the trainees.

Secondly, training resources and facilities are always required for an effective training program.

From the research findings, it was suggested that the NIE should supply sufficient teaching and learning materials, and use the available ones effectively. While the library and classrooms are



suggested to be enlarged and enriched, more computers in good condition are required for ICT classes for their usefulness. In addition, textbooks, and teaching and learning documents are suggested to be up to date and suitable for the Cambodian upper secondary school context, so that when trainees study the textbooks in the classrooms they probably can apply more knowledge in the schools where they will teach.

Thirdly, a critical, careful revision of the curriculum is required for a more effective training program. For instance, the trainees recommended that NIE drop some irrelevant subjects from the curriculum, including art studies, general English, and cultural studies. The trainees requested an extension of teaching hours in some major subjects, namely core English, teaching methodology, psychology, pedagogy, teaching professionalism, ICT, and especially the teaching practicum. Furthermore, more subjects that contribute to the increase in trainees' English competency, knowledge and skill are strongly urged. There is also a need for a curriculum development team and sufficient budget for this major revision or improvement.

Fourthly, training program management should be enhanced. In this connection, it is suggested that: 1) a feasibility study should be done to find out the real needs from trainees; 2) both trainers and trainees requested more capacity building programs, workshops/seminars, study tours, and a counseling service; 3) trainees urged both the NIE and the Ministry of Education, Youth, and Sport to increase their monthly allowance and dormitory arrangement for those who came from the provinces; 4) trainees demanded a compilation of textbooks that is suitable for the Cambodian context, a strict enforcement of the internal regulations, effective information sharing, and chances to evaluate trainers; and 5) both trainers and trainees suggested that the trainee screening process or recruitment process should be more restricted, so as to gain the trainees who have equivalent qualifications each year.

Theoretical Recommendations

After completing this research study, the researcher understands that many training evaluation theories and models have been adapted and adopted in the training evaluation field around the world. As a result, through collecting data from multiple stakeholders and sources, this study provides a new model of four dimensions as a theoretical framework for training evaluation in order to contribute to the field of training evaluation. The four dimensions looked at Training Curriculum, Training Resources, Learning Environment, and Training Management, or it is called CREM Dimension (Curriculum, Resources, Environment, and Management). From the findings of this study, the implications of CREM Dimension might be explained as follows: 1) Training Curriculum refers to both the main curriculum of the program and extra academic activities, which help to improve the trainees' knowledge, skill and ability; 2) Training Resources refers to both teaching and learning materials and facilities that both trainers and trainees are able to use during or after the training program; 3) Learning Environment refers to the on-campus environment that the trainees confront or interact with during their training program; and 4) Training Management refers to the organization of the management team of the training program.

Recommendations for Further Research

Within any study, there are limitations, which can be used to identify areas that could be strengthened in future research. Therefore, the researcher proposes the following recommendations for further research:

1). Since this current research study was a summative evaluation, a further study is recommended to conduct a formative evaluation that might confirm the findings of the current study by using both pre-test and post-test to compare with one another.

2). Although this current study employed the four-level model of Kirkpatrick and Kirkpatrick's (2006), the data collected for the last two levels (behavior and organizational results) were only done with trainers and administrators of the NIE. That is why further study is recommended to collect data from both the NIE's staff members and the Cambodian upper secondary schools' staff members where trainees work.

3). Further research is recommended to explore the effectiveness of the teaching practicum of the CEL-PTTP. This is because the findings from the open-ended questions showed that some trainees were not satisfied with the teaching practicum.

4). To gain a more comprehensive understanding about the effectiveness of the CEL-PTTP, the replication of this current study in any academic year in the future is strongly recommended.

Acknowledgements

The author of this article wishes to offer his sincere gratitude and appreciation to Her Royal Highness Princess Mahachakri Sirindhorn, who granted a full scholarship to him to study Master Degree of Education in TESL at Burapha University. He also extends special thanks to his research advisors, Dr. Montien Chomdokmai, and Assistant Professor Dr. Roongfa Kitiyanusan for their valuable advice and guidance to complete this research.

References

- Ankara, Turkey. UNESCO Phnom Penh Office (2010). UNESCO national education support strategy in Cambodia 2010 -2013. Phnom Penh City, Cambodia.
- Bhasuk, R. (1990). An evaluation of the context and input of the in-service teacher training 'ELT-MAP' programme II and its implications for teacher training. *Unpublished Master's thesis*, Mahidol University, Bangkok.
- Bray, J. H. & Howard, G. S. (1990). Methodological considerations in the evaluation of a teacher training program. *Journal of Education Psychology*, 72, 127-143.
- Chheang, S. (2008). Effectiveness of training information and communication technology by Khmer language software: A case study of the National Institute of Education, Cambodia. *Unpublished Master's thesis*, Mahidol University, Bangkok.
- Kanchanarak, T. (2002). Training officer's opinions towards a desirable competency base of trainers. Case study on Ministry of Education. *Unpublished Master's thesis*, Mahidol University, Bangkok.
- Kirkpatrick, D. L., & Kirkpatrick, J. D. (2006). *Evaluating Training Programs: The four Levels*. (3rd ed. San Francisco: Berrett-Koehler.
- Ministry of Education, Youth and Sports. (2009). *Teacher Professional Standards*. Phnom Penh City, Cambodia.
- National Center for Educational Development of Nepal. (2000). *Teacher Training Follow-up: A Study Report*. Kathmandu, Nepal.
- Tunç, F. (2010). Evaluation of an English language teaching program at a public university using CIPP model. *Unpublished Master's thesis*, Middle East Technical University,